

Haseltine vs Andrew-Mint  
Transcription February 20, 2025

Page 1

**COPY.** (457)

No. 910

April Term, 1910

United States Circuit Court

Eastern District of Pennsylvania

**UNITED STATES,**

vs.

**JOHN W. HASELTINE**

**AFFIDAVIT OF DEFENCE.**

June 23, 1910, filed.

*Return to*

**C. J. Dochkus**

3522 E. Thompson St.

Philadelphia, Pa.

Page 2

**COPY.**

United States

vs.

John W. Haseltine.

**U. S. C. C.**

E. Dist. of Penna.

No. 910, April Sess., 1910.

**AFFIDAVIT OF DEFENCE.**

John W. Haseltine, the above-named defendant, while denying that the plaintiff has set out any cause of action in the statement filed, avers that he has a just, true, and legal defence to the whole of the plaintiff's claim as follows:

1 - The defendant denies that the plaintiff has any right to, or right of possession in, the twenty-four pattern pieces mentioned in paragraph one of plaintiff's statement and therein called "metal pieces," and avers that the same are the property of this defendant and that this defendant did not "take and unjustly detain" the said twenty-four metal pieces, patterns or coins "from the plaintiff" as is averred in the writ under which the plaintiff seized the same, but that he, the said defendant, acquired title to the same from persons other than the plaintiff at Private or Public sale in the usual course of his business as a collector and dealer in coins.

2 - The defendant admits that all of the said pieces were struck from dies which were the property of the United States, but is advised and, therefore, avers that this fact does not confer upon plaintiff any title to, nor right of possession in said pieces.

3 - The defendant admits that the Exhibits A, B, C, D, & E, mentioned in paragraph three of the statement, copies of which are attached to and made part of the same, are true copies so far as they go, and avers that plaintiff's Exhibit A is only part of a circular letter, - a full copy of which is hereto attached and marked **Exhibit 1**. From said Circular letter it is

Page 3

self-evident that scope was given for acquisition of Pattern pieces or metal pieces of the same character as those involved in the suit.

The defendant further avers that under Section 3 of the rules quoted in Exhibit A. of Plaintiff's Statement and Sections 7 & 8 of Exhibit B., *it was the practice of the U. S. Mint officials to sell metal pieces of the character of those seized in this suit, under the name of "pattern pieces," over the counter at the Mint and apply the proceeds to the uses of the Government,* also to furnish copies of the same for Congressional Committees, to officers of the Mint, to certain special persons by name, and to *"any Incorporated Numismatic Society in the United States"* without ear-marking or in any way checking the same, and without any qualification or restriction upon their subsequent transfer, resale or exchange; and further it was the practice of the Curator of the Mint to exchange pieces of this character, which were labelled in the Mint's collection as *"pattern pieces"*, for other rare coins or medals.

Defendant further avers that the Fifteenth Annual Report of the Director of the Mint to the United States Treasurer for the fiscal year ending June 30th, 1887, shows that it was not until that year that definite and stringent rules were adopted prohibiting the transfer or sale of such pieces, and defendant avers that all of the twenty-four pieces seized in this action are of date prior to **1887**, and he is advised and, therefore, avers that the rules and regulations then established, have no bearing upon pieces of this character issued prior to that year.

Defendant has attached hereto as **Exhibit 2**—a tabulated Statement containing extracts from Government and other Publications in support of the averments defendant set forth.

4 - Defendant denies the averment in the fourth paragraph of Plaintiff's Statement that all of the metal pieces are expend—

Page 4

mental and represent designs not regularly adopted, but avers that at least one piece, being No. 6. on the list containing the first paragraph, is a proof coin of the lawful coinage adopted by the United States.

Defendant further avers that the 20 cent silver piece, being No. 3 in the plaintiff's list of pieces seized, is the identical coin obtained from the Mint in exchange for a certain rare gold coin, and said piece was subsequently sold at public sale on June 21, 1886.

5 - Defendant avers that the ten pieces mentioned in paragraph five of the plaintiff's Statement, are all prior in date to the year of 1887; that four of them were issued prior to 1868, up to which time, as stated by the Director of the Mint in his circular letter of 1868, such pieces *"had been given out or withheld by no rule whatever,"* and further, that it appears by the said Fifteenth Annual Report of the Mint, above noted, there were no specific regulations as to the irregular use of coinage dies prior to the Act of 1873, and in the same report it is stated that a very large number of such pieces, with irregular designs and in false metals, had been struck and sold both before 1873 and after that time, and that it was *not* the rule to strike for sale pieces not authorized without the sanction of the authorities at Washington; and further that in said Report the following statement occurs:

*"The sanction of this Bureau has been found in a number of cases, for the production and private issue of experimental pieces, some of which were in false metal."*

Said Report further states that the legality of this practice was not questioned until the year 1887. In that year the collection of former Superintendent Linderman was offered at Public Sale and the Government then investigated the collection with the view of seizing the same, and there—

Page 5

after permitted the sale to continue and included a large number of coins and pieces similar to those included in the present suit, and in fact, at least, **three** of the identical coins in suit were sold at that sale.

Attached hereto and marked defendant's **Exhibit 3.** is a list of such coins as were permitted to be sold in the sales of the Linderman collection.

Defendant further avers that in recent years between 1866 and 1909 there have been numerous sales of pattern pieces of the character of those in suit and defendant attaches hereto, as **Exhibit 4.**, a partial list of sales of pieces identical with those mentioned in this suit.

Defendant avers that the only pieces that the Government prohibited from being sold in the Linderman sale, were all those of a date later than **1888**, and only these pieces in false metals prior to that date, which were patterns of coins that were issued for actual **circulation**; and defendant avers that no one of these pieces, mentioned in either paragraph one or five of Plaintiff's Statement, falls within the prohibited class.

Defendant is advised, and therefore avers that, the only restriction by the Government is, therefore, upon all irregular pieces issued since **1888**, and pieces in false metals or dates prior to **1888**, only when they were copies or replicas of coins actually issued for circulation.

Upon the whole case defendant is advised and therefore avers that the plaintiff has shown no cause for action, that there was either actual authority for the transfer of title to the pieces in this suit or an implied ratification by the Government accepting a consideration for the same, and that the said transfers having been made without any check or reservation, the

Page 6

acquisition and possession of the same by the defendant is lawful.

Defendant, therefore, asks that, unless the Government requests that the whole matter be referred to a jury, this court direct a judgment for the defendant in this case, and that there be awarded to the defendant his damages and costs, and that the Marshal be directed to return the so-called metal pieces to the defendant.

**John W. Haseltine**

---

County of Philadelphia {  
State of Pennsylvania { SS.

John W. Haseltine, being duly sworn according to law, deposes and says that the facts set forth in the foregoing Affidavit of Defense are true and correct to the best of his knowledge, information, and belief.

Sworn and subscribed to before me {  
this 23rd day of June, A. D., 1910 {

**John W. Haseltine**

---

**William Linton**

Notary Public  
Commission Expires March 3rd, 1913.  
(seal)

5.

Page 7

**EXHIBIT 1.**

Mint of the United States  
Philadelphia, July 1, 1866.

**CIRCULAR LETTER**

in relation to

**AMERICAN MEDALS AND CABINET COINS**

Perhaps it is too apparent to need remark, that among the various kinds of souvenirs or monuments, none rank in higher esteem than **Medals**. Convenient and to human sense easy to preserve, demanding a high exercise of artistic and mechanical skill, often bearing a noble sentiment and always storing at least a date **these** and **legends**, they have attractions even for uncultivated taste, much more for learned men. Chiefly they are valuable as landmarks of **numismatic** collections. Gladly they are valuable as landmarks of history, and as a mode of honoring the distinguished services and merits, whether in war or peace; while in the line of art or benevolence, are a study of every age.

The American nation has not been backward, in making use of this elegant method of conferring honors. And almost from its foundation, the Mint has been its principal place for striking medals, on account of the relative relation of this business to its proper work, and of possessing the machinery, and the experienced artists and workmen, for the purpose.

Still, the Medal Department was never fully organized, so as to give facilities for obtaining copies of **national** medals, until an authorization by the Secretary Department in 1855, since which date this has been a systematic arrangement, and many medals have been struck and sold according to a printed tariff.

To aid in the execution of Medal and coin dies, the Mint, nearly thirty years ago, imported the French Machine, the **tour à Portrait de Contour**, for cutting dies from models. The Mint has recently contracted for; and is about to receive Hill's Engraving Machine, purchased under authority of Hon. Hugh McCulloch, Secretary of the Treasury, an English invention, for which it is claimed, that for its superior powers and singular ingenuity, it will supersede the other apparatus. We, therefore, expect to do justice to any orders, at a **less expense, and in less time, than under the former system.**

The occasion calls for a revision of our operations in this line, and for some reduction of prices, as will be found in the annexed schedule. **And as coinage branches, it is proposed to unite therewith, the annual issues of proof or specimen coins of the regular series, as heretofore; and the medallion or "pattern" coins which are not adopted or do not become regular currency.** Out of deference to the technicalities of collectors, and not because of its peculiar fitness for it, the place fails to be adopted, it is to be known as "pattern." **"Experimental" is a better term. These last have hitherto been given out, or withheld, by no rule whatever:** although

they have by degrees attained to a very considerable importance, on account of the eagerness of many collectors to obtain them. There is, indeed, a pretty strong reason, why these should be used only for their special purpose; namely, to aid the Treasury Department or the Congressional Committee, to form an idea of the **artistic appearance and practicality** of any newly proposed coin, or of any change of devices in an old one. But it has been found impossible to hold this rigid limit upon them. If we strike only a few, the punctilious collector will have one at any price, and a competition is created to obtain it. *It proposes to the merits of the prize, if issued but few, to enforce avoiding the secrecy of making such pieces privately, to leave some scope for the acquisition of them.*

This whole department will be under the supervision of the Director of the Mint, and all inquiries and requests, with or without money, must be referred to him. The medals and coins will be in the responsible custody of one of his clerks; who will also attend to the orders, answer the letters, and keep the accounts. The **making of dies and the striking of medals** proofs and patterns, will be left in charge of the Engraver, and at his responsibility; other officers of the Mint generally, aid or material and mechanical work fall within their province. **These arrangements, although internal, are here openly stated,** in a view to assure the public that there is a system of suitable checks and guards, against undue emissions or secret issues.

While providing for what may be regarded as a public exigency in making or striking of medals, by extending facilities possessed by the Mint, it is not intended to compete with private artists and workshops, but rather to aid their operations in this line, so far as it can be done without interfering with the specific duties of this institution. In fact, it is not intended to execute any medals here, that are merely for a private use, or for speculation, or for business-card—nor whatever we may ask must be directly from the original authority and not from any middle party; except it be an artist, performing part of the work himself.

When a gold medal is awarded, it will be advantageous to have it done at the Mint, where only fine gold is used. We have found otherwise by the trial of specific gravity to be of all grades of "*timeless*," down to that of ordinary watchcases; wearing, however, the aspect of pure gold.

The ensuing rules are in plain terms, and hardly require a statement of reasons. It may be said, however, in regard to the Rule against striking a coin or pattern after its proper date, that while it seemed desirable that some patterns of former years, which were very scarce or curious should be repeated, yet we could not issue them impartially without giving out an **infinite number of an issue**. If some kinds are thus struck, there would be a call on other kinds; there would be no known line where to begin or end.

Please remark out of date, bear a frailty on their face, and have no tie to interest, or value of a synchronous issue. An uncertainty is also kept up, as to the extent of the supply. And in case of *regular coinage*, they so far falsify the Mint Records and Tables, as to the amount of coinage and delivery, or as to

the very fact of such and such pieces having been coined in any given year.

On the whole, therefore, it seemed a plain course, to let the past go, and begin **anew**. And it is a satisfaction to be able to assure all parties, that there has been no resurgent striking in the present management.

In striking of specimens in other than their proper metal, never much practised, is to be

discontinued. This irregularity has, of course, been indulged with unlawful intent, and never would have happened, except at the urgency of those who possess something odd, or to avoid the outlay of gold or silver. **Such pieces have probably been valued at about twice the value of gold, down to 10 or 12¢.** But we would now lay down for against using dies meant for gold or silver upon copper or other base metals.

It is proper to say that before these Rules were matured, advice was sought of several Numismatic Societies, and gentlemen skilled in this branch of study. There has not been an entirely unanimity of opinion as to details, but the general tendency was towards the moral right herein initiated; and it is hoped that a general approbation will be accorded.

The extent to which the taste for cabinet coins, especially American, has reached, may be judged from the fact that we yearly dispense about eight hundred sets of proof pieces, of regular coinage.

It may be well here to give notice, that the proof sets of each new year, will be ready by the first of March.

#### **RULES.**

1. — No coins, nor pattern pieces, shall be struck after the year of their date, and to insure this, the dies shall be rendered unfit for that use.
2. — No coins, nor patterns, are to be issued in any but their **proper metal.**
3. — **Any experimental or pattern piece can be obtained at the Mint, within the year of its date, but no later.** Notwithstanding orders for such pieces will be registered, and attended to. Any patterns that remain on hand, at the end of the year, must be defaced: it is not desirable to make them as common as the proofs of regular coinage. If any sets or regular proofs remain over, they may be sold in the next year but no later.
4. — The price of 1 pattern coin, in any but precious metal will be three dollars in currency; 1 in gold or silver, the value of the metal in it. But when a pattern piece is adopted and used in the regular coinage, in the same year it will then be issued as a proof, at price **below its current value;** or if it comes out early in the year, it will be placed in the regular proof sets. **The Director reserves the right to send a pattern piece, of its date, to any incorporated Numismatic Society in the United States.** In such cases, if the pattern

Page 10

is in gold or silver, the value of the metal will be expected.

5. — **The price of the regular proof set of gold, will be forty-three dollars in gold;** the proof set of silver and copper, three dollars in silver, as heretofore. To suit the convenience of many, payment may be made in the currency equivalent.
6. — The profits of this whole department are reserved to the Medal Fund, which is a part of the public moneys; and are not to be a perquisite to any person holding a place in the Mint. All such persons are expected to refrain from dealings in this line, **not affording aid to speculators or dealers outside.** If this expectation is counteracted, it will call for serious notice. This rule, however, does not apply to such coins and medals as are **to within the scope of the department.** And it is, of course, intended that our Engravers shall be compensated for their work for medals that are to be paid for.

**HENRY R. LINDERMAN,**  
**Director.**

Page 11

**EXHIBIT 2.**

**PATTERNS** – definition, struck in, making in charge of disposal of; by selling, exchange, giving away, etc.

**DEFINITION**

*"The term 'pattern' is used here, out of the deference to the technicalities of collectors, and not because of its peculiar fitness; for if the piece fails to be adopted, it is not properly a pattern. 'Experimental' is a better term."*

— Circular Letter of Mint, July 1, 1866, p. 2.

*"Pattern-piece" seems to have come into popular usage, not without more or less official sanction, so as to include all the irregular or unauthorized productions of the mint.*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 134.

*"The term 'pattern' has during the last twenty years passed into common usage, so as to be applied mainly to trial pieces and experimental pieces technically and properly understood."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 134.

*"Since the establishment of the U. S. Mints, there have been innumerable varieties of 'pattern-pieces' prepared, suggesting endless varieties of almost every coin. Generally, there are a very few struck, MOSTLY IN COPPER, and then the dies are stored away with other experimentals."*

— Guide & History of U. S. Mint, 1885, p. 59.

*"Thus a pattern of a given date may take its place in the proof-set of coins of the same year."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 134.

**STRUCK IN**

*"Mostly copper"*

— Guide & History of U. S. Mint, 1885, p. 59.

*"The striking of specimens in other than their proper metal have been struck, as patterns, from the dime of 1791 down to our day."*

— (July 1, 1866) Circular Letter of Mint, July 1, 1866, p. 5.

*"The 'false-metal pieces', or copies of regular gold and silver coin in base metal, especially of the larger denominations, x x number from the year 1792 to 1868 some 185 varieties, of which 57 are of the dates from 1875 to 1885, inclusive."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 135.

*"October 22, 1863, a set of experimental coins for the years 1863 and 1865 was ordered by the Secretary of the Treasury to be furnished to Hon. George Opdyke, x x Half-dollars and quarter-dollars in silver, and the series of 50 (fifty) coins STRUCK IN COPPER."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 135.

*"December 28, 1877, sets for experimental pieces in (gold, silver & copper) were authorized for the Committee. Experimental coins of this description were informally sold at the Mint at Philadelphia."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 136.

**"May 13, 1868 xxx four sets of pieces in ALUMINUM** were struck at the Mint at Philadelphia from the whole series of coinage dies of that year for and at the expense of the Secretary of the Treasury."

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 136.

*"There is recent evidence that one set of the same description and date passed into other hands."*  
— p. 136.

*"The sanction of this Bureau has been found in a number of cases for the production and private issue of experimental pieces—some of which were in false metal."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 137.

*"How far the sanction of this Bureau may be presumed to have been found for the production and private issue of trial and experimental pieces in soft metal and otherwise since 1873—xxx—the files and records of this Bureau disclose."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 137.

*"December 15, 1877, XXXX, nine experimental pieces of silver dollars were struck in copper."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 138.

*"December 17, 1877, twelve experimental pieces of silver dollars were struck in silver and two in copper."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 138.

*"No Pattern pieces or sets were sold during the year."*

— 13th Annual Report, June 30, 1884, p. 44.

*"No pattern pieces were struck for sale during the year, but 3,057 proof-sets were sold."*

— 13th Annual Report, June 30, 1885, p. 7.

*"The U. S. permitted the sale of the Linderman collection in which 201 pattern pieces, covering a period from 1837 to 1878, were sold."*

*"October 10, 1887, New Mint regulations were put in force so as to thereby stop the issue of pattern or experimental pieces."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 138, 139.

#### **MAKING IN, CHARGE OF**

*"The making of dies and the striking of medals, proofs, and patterns, will be in charge of the Engraver, and at his responsibility."*

— Circular Letter of Mint, July 1, 1866, p. 5.

*"All experimental and trial dies shall be in the custody of the engraver, who shall safely keep all models and hubs from which experimental dies have been prepared."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 138.

*"All experimental and trial pieces shall be struck by the engraver from planchets furnished by the coiner upon requisition signed by the superintendent for a specific number of pieces."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 138.

#### **11.**

Page 13

#### **SALE IN CHARGE OF MEDAL CLERK**

— 11th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 134.

*"All medals, proof coins, and specimen or pattern pieces shall be delivered by the Coiner to the Superintendent, or one of his clerks, to be called the medal clerk, who shall keep an accurate*



*account of all the medals sold by him," etc.*

— Regulations, May 14, 1874, p. 6.

— Statement of Demand.

## **DISPOSAL OF:**

### **I. BY SELLING**

*"Any experimental or pattern pieces can be obtained at the Mint, within the year of its date, but not after." "Standing orders for such pieces will be registered, and attended to." Any patterns that remain on hand, at the end of the year, must be defaced; it is not desirable to make them as common as proofs of regular coinage. If any sets or regular proofs remain over, they may be sold in the next year, but no later.*

— Circular Letter of Mint, **RULES**, July 1, 1866, p. 6.

*"The profits of this whole department are reserved to the Medal Fund, which is a part of the public moneys." — p. 7.*

*"Proof coins and **Pattern Pieces** may be struck and sold subject to these regulations, when authorized by the Director of the Mint."*

— Regulations, June 25, 1868, Statement of Demand, p. 8.

*"The price of Medals, Proof Coins, **Pattern Pieces**, &c., shall be fixed by the Superintendent of the Mint, with the approval of the Director."*

— Regulations of the U.S. Mint, 1885.

— History of U.S. Mint, 1885, p. 146.

*"No proof-sets or pattern-pieces of coins shall be coined, nor dies executed, of such denominations of coin as are not coined for general circulation during the year."*

*"Proof-sets and pattern-pieces shall be furnished for the current calendar year only, and of such coins as are struck during the year."*

— Regulations of U.S. Mint, January 17, 1887, p. 10.

### **1878 \$5.00 in Copper**

*"Purchased at the Mint: but one or two have ever been sold."*

— Sale by Bangs & Co., Feb. 1 & 2, 1887. **Cat. 848**

*"There is, indeed, no reason to believe that the Mint has at any period sustained loss of precious metal from irregular issues; their intrinsic value is it is safe to assume, having in all cases been made good to the special department of the mint from which they took source."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 131.

### **II. BY EXCHANGE**

*"One trial dime of 1792, and one experimental 20 cent piece of 1874, found in antiquities in the coin cabinet of the Mint at Philadelphia, were there accounted, as late as December 1885, as beyond the sales of tradition, in exchange for certain rare gold and silver coins."*

— 15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 137.

*"This is one of two specimens in the Mint Cabinet, and was obtained in exchange."*

— **Dr. E. Maris by S. V. Henkels & Co., Jun. 21, 1886, Cat. 189.**

— **This is No. 2 in the present suit.**

**12.**

### **BY GIVING AWAY**

*"The Director reserves the right to send a pattern piece, without charge, to any Incorporated*

*Numismatic Society in the United States."*

— Circular Letter of Mint, **RULES**, July 1, 1866, p. 6.

*"The Superintendent will furnish, without charge, on application therefor, a Pattern Piece to any Incorporated Numismatic Society in the United States."*

— Regulations of Mint, July 1, 1885.

— **History of U.S. Mint, 1885, p. 146.**

*"The Director reserves the right to furnish a pattern piece without charge to any Incorporated Numismatic Society in the United States."*

— Regulations of U.S. Mint, May 14, 1874.

— **Statement of Demand, p. 7.**

*"The Superintendent shall furnish, without charge, on application therefor, a pattern-piece to any Incorporated Numismatic Society in the United States. In such cases, if the pattern is in gold or silver, the value of the metal shall be required."*

— Regulations of U.S. Mint, January 17, 1887.

— **Statement of Demand, p. 9.**

*"The Regulations adopted October 10, 1887 stopped the giving away of pattern pieces."*

— **15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 138.**

*"There is no provision in the Regulations of January 21, 1888."*

— See: **Statement of Demand, p. 10.**

---

## LIST OF

*"The number from the year 1792 to 1885 some 185 varieties, of which some 57 are of dates from 1875 to 1885 inclusive."*

— **15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 135.**

*"As to another collection, this list comprises 232 pieces, of which some 126 are impressions in false metal, 78 of that number being false-metal pieces bearing dates from 1875 to 1885. Of the 126 pieces in false-metal, 29 are 'false-metal' pieces struck from regular dies. Eleven of this number are of date between 1875 and 1885 inclusive."*

— **15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 135.**

---

## IRREGULAR COINS ISSUED.

*"If any authority of law was found for the change of device of the gold-dollar in 1854, from that of 1849, for the complete change in design of the silver dollar in 1873 from the design of 1867, and of the latter from that of 1866, such authority must have been found in provisions of law subsequently codified into section 3510, XXX. So too with regard to other minor changes."*

*"Whatever the intention of this section may have been held to be by Director Linderman, the same executive officer of the Mint by whom, in co-operation with Comptroller of the Currency John Jay Knox, the coinage act was mainly collated and drafted, the terms of this section absolutely fail to provide for change of design in existing coins."*

— **15th Annual Report, June 30, 1887, p. 125.**

13.

<b>Cat. No.</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Description</b>
12.	1828	
	1835	
	1856 (2)	
	1868	
	1881	
13.	1831	<i>Restrike male</i>
14.	1836	Duplicate of 14
15.	1836	<i>Restrike</i>
16.	1836	Duplicate of 15
17.	1840	<i>Restrike</i>
18.	1840	Duplicate of 18
19.	1841	<i>Restrike</i>
20.	1841	Duplicate of 20
21.	1842	<i>Restrike</i>
22.	1842	Duplicate of 22
24.	1845	<i>Restrike</i>
25.	1845	Duplicate of 24
26.	1844	<i>Restrike</i>
27.	1844	Duplicate of 26
28.	1845	<i>Restrike</i>
29.	1845	Duplicate of 28
30.	1848	<i>Restrike</i>
31.	1848	Duplicate of 30
32.	1847	<i>Restrike</i>
33.	1847	Duplicate of 32
34.	1852	<i>Restrike</i>
35.	1852	Duplicate of 34
36.	1852	<i>Restrike</i>
37.	1852	Duplicate of 36

---

## **"SILVER COINS."**

<b>Cat. No.</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Description</b>
38.	1827	1/4 dollar
39.	1827	Duplicate of 38
40.	1804	4 dollar
41.	1836	Dollar-pattern
42.	1836	Duplicate of 41-pattern

**Cat. No. Year Description**

43.	1838	Dollar-pattern
44.	1838	Dollar-pattern
45.	1838	Dollar-pattern
46.	1838	Dollar-pattern
47.	1839	Dollar-pattern
48.	1839	Dollar-pattern
49.	1851	Dollar
50.	1851	Dollar
51.	1853	Dollar
52.	1854	Dollar
53.	1873	Trade dollar
54.	1874	Trade dollar

---

**"U.S. EXPERIMENTAL and TRIAL PIECES."****Cat. No. Year Description**

56.	1877	1/8 cent - copper
		1877 25
		1877 50 (7)
		1877 1 dollar (2)

**In all 11 patterns****Cents, two cents, three cents****Cat. No. Year Description**

57.	1850	<i>Ring cents</i> nickel
58.	1850	Duplicate pair of 57
59.	1850	<i>Ring cents</i> nickel
60.	1850	Copper
61.	1851	Cent
62.	1854	
63.	1854	
64.	1855	Copper-bronze
65.	1856	<b>"No date"</b>
66.	1856	
67.	1858	Copper-nickel
		1858
		1858
		1858 Designs all differ

**Cat. No. Year Description**

68.	1868	5 cent - copper-nickel
69.	1868	
70.	1868	Nickel-copper
	1868	
	1868	
71.	1868	
72.	1869	2-cents copper
73.	1850	3-cents silver
74.	1850	
75.	1850	
77.	1850	Nickel
78.	1850	Copper
79.	1859	Nickel

**14.**

Page 16

**"Five Cents"****Cat. No. Year Material**

80.	1866	Nickel
	1866	
81.	1866	Copper
		Nickel
82.	1867	Aluminum
83.	1867	Copper
84.	1867	Aluminum
		Nickel
85.	1867	Copper
86.	1867	Nickel
87.	1867	
88.	1867	Nickel
89.	1867	Copper
91.	1869	Nickel

---

**"Ten Cents or Dimes"****Cat. No. Year Material**

92.	1865	Aluminum
93.		

<b>Cat. No.</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Material</b>
94.	No date	Aluminum
95.	1868	Aluminum
97.		Copper
98.	1868	Nickel
99.	No date	Silver
		Nickel
		Copper
		Alloy of three
100.	No date	Silver
		Nickel
		Copper
		Alloy of three

---

### **"Twenty Cents or Fifth Dollars"**

<b>Cat. No.</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Material</b>
101.	1874	Silver
102.		
103.	1875	Silver
104.		Copper
105.		Silver
106.		
107.		
108.		
109.		
110.		Copper, White metal
111.	1875	Copper
112.		Silver
113.		
114.		
115.		
118.		
119.	No date	Reverse hub die of 1/4 dollar, about 1828, Lead

---

### **"Half Dollars"**

<b>Cat. No.</b>	<b>Year</b>	<b>Material</b>
120.	1838	Silver
121.		
122.	1839	

**Cat. No. Year Material**

123.

124. 1859 All differ in designs

135. 1859 Silver

All differ in designs

---

**"Dollars"****Cat. No. Year Material**

129. 1873 Silver

130. 1872

131. 1873 Trade Silver

132. 1873 Copper

133. Copper

**15.**

Page 17

**Dollars****Cat. No. Year Material**

134. 1873 White metal

135. 1873 White metal

136. 1875 White metal

137. 1875 White metal

138. 1878 Silver

139. 1878 Silver

140. 1878 Silver

141. 1878 Silver

142. Copper

143. Gold

144.

145.

146.

147. Silver

148. No date Silver Planchet

---

**Designs for Gold Coins****Cat. No. Year Material**

149. 1836 Gold

**Cat. No. Year Material**

150.	1852	Ring dollar Nickel
151.	1852	Copper
152.		Copper
153.	1860	Five dollars Copper
154.		
155.	1868	Aluminum Copper
156.		Aluminum Copper
157.	1875	Ten dollars Five dollars White metal
158.		Ten dollars White metal
159.	1878	Five dollars Copper Ten dollars
160.		Five dollars Ten dollars
161.	1873	Five dollars Copper Ten dollars
164.	1868	Aluminum Copper
166.	1869	Ten dollars
167.		
168.		
169.	1874	
170.		
16.		

Page 18

**EXHIBIT 4.**

**1. 1859 Cent – Copper-Nickel, Bronze (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- Dr. Hopkins et al. by Chapman, July 22, 1901, #191 – *Copper*
- H. B. Smith by Chapman, June 29, 1906, #758 – *Copper-Nickel*
- Taylor et al. by H. Chapman, June 17, 1908, #1282 – *Copper-Nickel*
- F. Zerbe et al. by H. Chapman, Sep. 30, 1908, #574 – *Copper-Nickel*
- H. L. Jewett by S. H. Chapman, June 21, 1909, #1809 – *Copper-Nickel*



---

## **2. 1859 Cent – Copper-Nickel, Bronze (*In suit*)**

### **Sales:**

- L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #108 – *Copper-Nickel*
  - Taylor et al. by H. Chapman, June 17, 1908, #1281 – *Copper-Nickel*
  - F. Zerbe et al. by H. Chapman, Sep. 30, 1908, #533 – *Copper-Nickel*
- 

## **3. 1863 Cent – Copper (*In suit*)**

### **Sales:**

- H. P. Smith by Chapman, May 8–11, 1904, #170 – *Copper*
  - #171 – *Nickel*
- 

## **4. 1863 "Two Cents" – Copper (*In suit*)**

### **Sales:**

- H. R. Linderman by Scott S. & Co., 2-28-'88, #2 – *Copper*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #130 – *Bronze-Copper*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #130 – *Copper-Nickel*
  - D. S. Wilson by S. H. Chapman, March 13, 1907, #160 – *Copper*
- 

## **5. 1868 5 Cents – Nickel (*In suit*)**

### **Sales:**

- L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #184 – *Nickel*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #184 – *Copper, Proof*
  - H. P. Wilson by S. H. Chapman, March 17, 1908 – *Copper*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #184 – *Copper*
- 

## **6. 1864 2 Cents – Copper-Nickel (*In suit*)**

### **Sales:**

- L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #141 – *Thick Bronze*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #141 – *Copper & Oreide*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #141 – *Bronze*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #140 – *Aluminum*
  - T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Feb. 7–8, 1910, #322 – *Copper-Nickel*
- 

## **7. 1866 1/2 Dollar – Copper, Silver (*In suit*)**

### **Sales:**

- L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #158 – *Copper*
  - T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Feb. 7–8, 1910, #289 – *Copper*
- 

## **8. 1867 Ten Dollar – Copper, Gold (*In suit*)**

### **Sales:**

- L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #122 – *Copper Bronzed*
- L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #122 – *Copper Bronzed*
- Estate of J. W. Scott Co., Oct. 26, 1906, #194 – *Copper Proof*
- H. P. Smith by Chapman, May 8–11, 1904, #364 – *Bronze Proofs*

**9. 1874 – 20 Cents – Silver (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- Dr. E. Maris by S. V. Henkels & Co., June 21, 1886, #189 – *Silver*
  - *Obtained in exchange at Mint, 15th Annual Report, p. 137*
  - H. R. Linderman by Bangs & Co., Feb. 28, 1888, #101 – *Silver*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #287 – *Silver*
  - H. L. Jewett's by S. H. Chapman, June 21, 1909, #731 – *Silver*
- 

**10. 1875 – Dollar – Copper, Silver (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- H. R. Linderman by Bangs & Co., Feb. 28, 1888, #137 – *White metal*
  - T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, March 12, 1909, #449 – *Copper*
- 

**11. 1881 – 3 Cents – Copper, Silver (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- A. Stickney by H. Chapman, June 25, 1907, #599 – *Nickel*
  - T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Feb. 25, 1909, #326 – *Copper*
- 

**12. 1885 – Dollar – Silver (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- H. P. Smith by Chapman, May 8–11, 1904, #1470 – *Silver*
  - Dr. Ed. Maris by S. V. Henkels & Co., June 21, 1886, #258 – *Copper*
- 

**13. 1870 – Dollar – Silver (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Nov. 30, 1909, #721
  - H. P. Smith by Chapman, May 8–11, 1904, #1407 – *Silver*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #204 – *Silver*
  - L. G. Parmelee by Bangs & Co., June 25, 1890, #205 – *Copper*
- 

**14. 1881 – Cent – Copper (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Feb. 25, 1909, #327 – *Copper*
- 

**15. 1881 – 5 Cents – Copper, Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- Dr. Ed. Maris by S. V. Henkels & Co., June 21, 1886, #238 – *Nickel*
  - H. P. Smith by Chapman, May 8–11, 1904, #1463 – *Nickel*
- 

**16. 1883 – 5 Cents – Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Dec. 10, 1909, #655 – *Nickel*
- T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Dec. 10, 1909, #656 – *Copper*

---

**17. 1883 – 5 Cents – Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Oct. 17, 1908, #228 – *Nickel*
- 

**18. 1882 – 5 Cents – Copper, Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- M. A. Stickney by H. Chapman, June 25, 1907, #608 – *Copper*
  - T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Oct. 17, 1908, #237 – *Copper*
- 

**19. 1882 – 5 Cents – Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Dec. 10, 1909, #655 – *Nickel*
- 

**20. 1882 – 5 Cents – Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- Dr. Ed. Maris by S. V. Henkels & Co., June 21, 1886, #246 – *Nickel*

**18.**

Page 20

**21. 1882 – 5 Cents – Copper, Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:** (*None listed*)

---

**22. 1882 – 5 Cents – Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- C. Steigerwalt Cat., Nov. 18, 1894, #36 – *Nickel*
- 

**23. 1882 – 5 Cents – Copper, Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:** (*None listed*)

---

**24. 1883 – 5 Cents – Nickel (*In suit*)**

**Sales:**

- T. L. Elder by D. R. Kennedy, Dec. 10, 1909, #660 – *Copper*

**19.**